

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

**MEMBERS PRESENT**

Jim Sampson	CF Industries
Kim Cressman	City of Cape Coral
Steve Adams	City of Punta Gorda
Bill Byle	County - Charlotte
Karen Bickford	County - Lee
Greg Blanchard	County - Manatee
John Ryan	County - Sarasota
Sarah Erickson	Florida Fish and Wildlife Conservation Commission
Greg Tolley	Florida Gulf Coast University
Betty Staugler	Florida Sea Grant – Charlotte County Extension
Sears Coker	Peace River Citrus Growers Association
Sam Stone	Peace River Manasota Regional Water Supply Authority
Loren Coen	Sanibel Captiva Conservation Foundation
Peter Doering	South Florida Water Management District
Sid Flannery	Southwest Florida Water Management District

**ALSO PRESENT**

Mike Messina	CF Industries
Brett Solomon	Entrix
Wayne Daltry	Lee County Smart Growth
Cheryl Clark	Florida Department of Environmental Protection
Ray Leary	Florida Department of Environmental Protection
Tony Janicki	Janicki Environmental
Mike Wessel	Janicki Environmental
Tom Fraser	Mote
Rick Bartleson	SCCF
Julianna Dafrota	South Florida Water Management District
Lizanne Garcia	Southwest Florida Water Management District
Kris Kaufman	Southwest Florida Water Management District
Ed Sherwood	Tampa Bay Estuary Program
Claire Sunquist	UF/Sea Grant
Marti McGuire	USDC National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
Lisa Beaver	Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program
Judy Ott	Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program

**1. Call to Order and Introductions**

Betty Staugler called the meeting to order at 1:35 pm.

**2. Agenda Additions or Deletions**

Betty Staugler asked for agenda additions or deletions. Lisa Beaver requested to add a review of the Draft Scope of Work for CHAPs Public Interest Projects as Item 10.5.

**3. Public Comments on agenda**

Betty Staugler asked for public comments on the agenda. No public comments were given.

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

**4. Approval of Consent Agenda.**

Betty Staugler asked if there were any changes to the minutes of the April 8, 2009 TAC meeting or the TAC 2010 Meeting Schedule and Locations. The proposed TAC meeting schedule for 2010 is: February 10 in Lakeland, April 14 in Bonita Springs, July 14 in Venice, and October 13 in Fort Myers. No changes were given.

**JIM SAMPSON MOVED, SECONDED BY WAYNE DALTRY, TO APPROVE THE CONSENT AGENDA, INCLUDING THE MINUTES AND MEETING SCHEDULE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**5. Lower Peace River and Shell Creek Minimum Flows and Levels (MFLs)**

Sid Flannery/SWFWMD presented a summary of the SWFWMD proposed Lower Peace River and Shell Creek MFLs, similar to the one given to the Science Forum June 10, 2009 by Marty Kelly/SWFWMD. CHNEP and SWFWMD staff had planned to offer this item through the normal conference cycle beginning with the July 8 TAC meeting and ending with the Policy Committee meeting on August 17. However, the Governing Board was scheduled to consider initiating rule-making on the MFL on June 23 with possible adoption of the MFL on July 28. Utilizing the Advocacy and Review procedures, CHNEP issued a letter requesting a delay of initializing rule-making and a draft of comments regarding the MFL document. Because of CHNEP comments and other comments, SWFWMD does not plan to seek adoption of the rule on July 28 and is anticipating September. CHNEP understands that SWFWMD is preparing a written response to our comments. The TAC may chose to convene an ad hoc subcommittee to review the response and to refine the draft comments.

Discussion ensued, including: SWFWMD won't go to rule making until at least September; salinity zones used in the analyses for Peace River are <2 ppt, <5 ppt, < 15 ppt; calculations use a hydrodynamic model for the Peace River and a regression model for Shell Creek; Shell Creek hydrobiological monitoring has been conducted since mid-1990's; and that PRMRWA Hydro-Biological Monitoring Panel will be preparing comments. Lisa indicated we will make the ad hoc review committee open to the public and announce the meeting date through email and the CHNEP website.

**WAYNE DALTRY MOVED, SECONDED BY JOHN RYAN, TO DIRECT STAFF TO ESTABLISH AN AD HOC SUBCOMMITTEE TO EVALUATE THE CHNEP LOWER PEACE RIVER MFL COMMENTS AFTER THE RESPONSE FROM THE SWFWMD HAS BEEN RECEIVED. THE MOTION CARRIED WITH TWO ABSTENTIONS.**

**6. Southwest Florida/Charlotte Harbor Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment Report**

Jim Beaver/SWFRPC presented a summary of draft Southwest Florida/Charlotte Harbor Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment, Technical Document 09-2. The study was funded by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to evaluate climate-change effects on ecosystems and infrastructure in the Charlotte Harbor estuary. EPA selected six estuaries, including Charlotte Harbor, as case studies for local action to protect sensitive coastal ecosystems and economies from potential effects of climate change. CHNEP received two climate change related grants:

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment (\$65,600 with \$30,000 from EPA Region 4) and Climate Change Adaptation Plan for Punta Gorda (\$100,000 with \$50,000 EPA headquarters).

The Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment study evaluated the effects of climate-change on ecosystems and infrastructure surrounding the Charlotte Harbor estuary. Three different severities of sea level rise were evaluated, based on EPA's *The Probability of Sea Level Rise* publication: least-case scenario (90% probability of occurring by 2100) with average sea level rise = 10.4 inches; moderate case (50% probability by 2100) with average sea level rise = 19.8 inches, and worst case (5% probability by 2100) with average sea level rise = 35.9 inches. For each scenario, lists were developed of significant potential effects on the human and native ecosystems and associated climate-change parameters. The lists were developed based on relevant technical documents. The results include: an assessment of significant potential effects, identification of potentially critical areas where adaptation options could be implemented, analysis of potential adaptations, and development of options for minimizing the social, economic and environmental costs of anticipated climate effects. Both this project and the Climate Change Adaptation Plan for the City of Punta Gorda are anticipated to be completed by December 2009.

Discussion ensued, including: the use of the document, separating the results of the vulnerability vs. adaptations into 2 documents; how the results affect the CHNEP CCMP and Priority Actions (ie. seagrasses); inclusion of any policy recommendations from organizations addendums to the report; how the identified key vulnerabilities were ranked; and how the rankings of the vulnerabilities relate to the CCMP. Lisa will develop and send a survey to Management Conference members requesting their ranking of the vulnerabilities developed from the report.

**KAREN BICKFORD MOVED, SECONDED BY KIM CRESSMAN, TO RECOMMEND THAT THE POLICY COMMITTEE APPROVE THE SW FLORIDA/CHARLOTTE HARBOR CLIMATE CHANGE VULNERABILITY ASSESSMENT, TECHNICAL DOCUMENT 09-02 AND REQUEST DIRECTION REGARDING INTEGRATING REPORT RESULTS INTO THE CHNEP CCMP. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**7. Reservoir Workshop Report**

Tom Taylor/FCRC (via phone) presented a summary of the draft Workshop on Watershed Reservoirs: Locations, Effects and Solutions, Technical Document 09-03. The workshop was held April 13-14, 2009 to address concerns of the CAC about the cumulative impacts of reservoirs within the CHNEP. It implements the *Comprehensive Conservation and Management Plan (CCMP) Update 2008* Priority Action HA-K and provided a forum for exchange of technical information between scientists and citizens.

A Reservoir Workshop Subcommittee helped develop the workshop purposes, structure and agenda. Florida Conflict Resolution Consortium assisted with planning, facilitating and reporting the results of the workshop. Johnson Engineering developed pre-workshop background materials. Three peer reviewers, including: Dr. Ernst Peebles from USF, Mr. Arturo Torres from USGS and Dr. Sam Upchurch from SDI Environmental Services, Inc. assisted with interpreting workshop presentations. Ms Cynthia Barnett gave the key note presentation.

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

The Workshop included 6 sessions, 26 presentations, 6 facilitated discussions and acceptability ratings of peer reviewer conclusions and participant observations by workshop participants. Approximately 145 people attended the workshop, representing local, state and federal agencies, universities, research institutions, citizens, industries and environmental organizations. The report summarizes the purposes, presentations, facilitated discussions, peer review conclusions and workshop participant observations for each of the 6 sessions. It also includes workshop participants' ratings of the acceptability of the key points from each session.

Workshop Participants identified the following actions essential to implementing Priority Action HA-K:

- Clarify definitions and complete an inventory of the numbers, types and locations of current, proposed and possible reservoirs and related storage facilities within the CHNEP.
- Coordinate agency efforts from a watershed perspective during siting, assessment and permitting of reservoirs, including cumulative demographic, economic, political, legal, public safety and environmental factors.
- Further explore the "eco-reservoirs" concept.
- Enhance interagency coordination of reservoir management using improved models and more monitoring data, and in some cases conducting special studies to assess performance.
- Give greater consideration to climate change and its effects.
- Assure unbiased technical reviews of findings regarding reservoirs, possibly using a National Research Council Panel approach.
- Agree that reservoirs can provide ecosystem benefits and meet human needs if properly sited, designed and managed.

Judy Ott summarized the comments received to date about the report from PRMRWSA, which mostly related to editorial changes that added balance to the document.

Discussion ensued, including: using medians vs. means for the acceptability ranking results; deleting the medians of the acceptability rankings; the need to add reference documents; the need to evaluation of historical vs. current natural water storage in the watershed; need to describe how reservoirs can enhance water budgets; the need to evaluate ecological impacts of changes in water storage; and the need to add a section to report for next steps for evaluating and minimizing ecological impacts of reservoirs and changes in water storage. Staff will incorporate suggested changes into the document; forward it to the Peer Reviewers for review and pass any substantial content changes through the TAC for final review.

**SAM STONE MOVED, SECONDED BY JIM SAMPSON, TO DIRECT STAFF TO INCORPORATE COMMENTS AND RECOMMEND THAT THE POLICY COMMITTEE APPROVE THE WORKSHOP ON WATERSHED RESERVOIRS: LOCATIONS, EFFECTS AND SOLUTIONS, TECHNICAL DOCUMENT 09-30. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**8. Water Quality Targets Refinement Project: Seagrass Targets**

Tony Janicki presented a summary of the FY09 Technical Project Water Quality Targets Refinement Project Task 2 Seagrass Targets Interim Report. The purpose of the project is to provide technically-defensible quantitative water quality and seagrass restoration and protection targets for the CHNEP. There are 4 tasks: 1. refine the estuary segmentation scheme; 2. determine seagrass targets based on historical seagrass acreage; 3. develop water clarity targets;

TAC Meeting Minutes - Draft

July 8, 2009

Prepared by J. Ott

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

and 4. develop pollutant loading estimates. TAC subcommittee reviews the results of each task. The subcommittee met January 22 and May 22 to review the segmentation scheme and seagrass target methods. The Task 2 Interim Report includes the historical seagrass acreages for each estuary segment. For discussion, the report also includes possible seagrass protection and restoration targets based on a comparison of historical acres to mean annual acres from 1988 – 2006. Other options for basing seagrass targets include: maximum area from recent surveys; mean area from the last 3 surveys; most recent area; and historical area (minus “non-restorable” areas lost to activities such as dredge and fill).

Discussion ensued, including: if the method is effective for capturing seagrasses in the tidal areas of the Caloosahatchee, Myakka and Peace Rivers; how to incorporate additional data from more detailed studies in localized areas; and how to convey ranges of survey results. It was concluded that Janicki would make the following changes to the report: 1) delete range annual extents and add standard deviation to the mean annual extent; 2) identify on the summary table via asterisk that Tidal Caloosahatchee, Myakka and Peace Rivers are highly colored and this method may not capture all seagrasses in these area; 3) references to additional localized surveys; and 4) expand the explanation of the uncertainty of the estimates.

**WAYNE DALTRY MOVED, SECONDED BY GREG TOLLEY, TO RECOMMEND THAT THE POLICY COMMITTEE APPROVE THE WATER QUALITY TARGETS REFINEMENT PROJECT TASK 2 SEAGRASS TARGETS INTERIM REPORT WITH THE ADDITION OF THE FOUR CHANGES SUMMARIZED ABOVE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY, THOUGH IT IS WAS NOTED THAT THE NUMBER OF TAC MEMBERS PRESENT TO VOTE HAD DECLINED.**

**9. CHAPs Water Quality and Seagrass Comparison Report**

Judy Ott explained the status of the review of the FY05-08 Technical Project “Comparisons of the CHEVWQMN, CCHMN, and Seagrass Monitoring Programs, with Estuary Region Specific Optical Model: 2001-2007” report. The project implements the CCMP Priority Actions WQ-B and WQ-G. At the Feb 11, 2009 TAC meeting Ray Leary presented the draft results of the project. The TAC directed staff to form a subcommittee to review the report. Staff invited 21 scientists to participate in the report review subcommittee and requested review comments in mid-March. Comments were received from Kellie Dixon with Mote and Teresa Coley and Chris Buzzelli with SFWMD during April, 2009. After reviewing the report and the submitted comments, CHNEP review comments were provided to Ray June 26, 2009. The comments are currently being incorporated into a final document.

Discussion ensued, including: whether to accept the document or refer it back to the subcommittee; whether the habitat suitability model was included in the project Scope of Work; limiting the report to that required by the project Scope of Work; and how the water quality targets included in the report relate to the FY09 Technical Project with Janicki for Water Quality Targets Refinement.

The TAC directed staff to convene the CHAPs report review subcommittee to review the revised “Comparison of the “Comparisons of the CHEVWQMN, CCHMN, and Seagrass Monitoring Programs, with Estuary Region Specific Optical Model: 2001-2007” report.

TAC Meeting Minutes - Draft  
July 8, 2009  
Prepared by J. Ott

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

**10. Water Quality Status and Trends Scope of Service**

Lisa Beever presented a summary of the draft FY10 Workplan Project Triennial Water Quality Status and Trends Scope of Service. Because Janicki Environmental, Inc. has the previous data and methods, they would be a sole source contract. Working with Janicki Environmental, inc., CHNEP staff identified components of the scope which could be the most useful to conference members, including: trends assessments for all parameters for which have impairments (such as metals); pulling organic nitrogen from Kjeldahl nitrogen to be able to compare with nitrates/nitrites and ammonia; identifying meaningful thresholds for thematic mapping; and adding monthly maps of means, normal minimums and normal maximums (formerly the CHEC Water Quality web site). Staff is especially interested in TAC review of parameters and proposed deliverables. Little discussion ensued.

**WAYNE DALTRY MOVED, SECONDED BY PETER DOERING, TO RECOMMEND THAT THE POLICY COMMITTEE APPROVE THE WATER QUALITY STATUS AND TRENDS SCOPE OF SERVICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**10.5 CHAPs Public Interest Projects Scope of Work**

Lisa Beever presented a summary of the proposed CHAPs Public Interest Projects funding, purpose and Scope of Work. Some portion of the \$100,000 of public interest funds from the Punta Gorda Hotel (Asmar/Best Western) project will be provided to CHNEP to contract with Ray Leary for the purpose of enhancing the reliability and accessibility of water quality and seagrass monitoring results conducted by the Charlotte Harbor and Estero Bay Aquatic Preserves. The 5 tasks include: implementing quality assurance procedures; implementing data management procedures; facilitating RAMP data analyses; assessing economic/social/environmental benefits of protected lands; and identifying gaps in water quality monitoring data.

**WAYNE DALTRY MOVED, SECONDED BY PETER DOERING, TO RECOMMEND THAT THE POLICY COMMITTEE APPROVE THE WATER QUALITY STATUS AND TRENDS SCOPE OF SERVICE. THE MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**11. Coastal Charlotte Harbor Monitoring Network (CCHMN) Annual Review**

Lisa Beever referred TAC members to the Item 11 CCHMN summary and attachments in the agenda packet. Judy Ott informed the members that funding for field monitoring and laboratory analyses for the Tidal Caloosahatchee River and San Carlos Bay strata was not renewed for FY10, starting October 1, 2009 and that staff would be working with partners to find a mechanism to continue the monitoring in these 2 strata.

**12. NEP Program Report**

Lisa Beever referred TAC members to the Item 12 NEP Program Report summary table for April 1, 2009 to June 22, 2009 in the agenda packet.

**13. Member Comments**

Betty Staugler asked for member comments. No Comments were offered.

**Meeting Minutes**  
**Charlotte Harbor National Estuary Program**  
**Technical Advisory Committee**  
**July 8, 2009**  
**Arcadia, FL**

**14. Public Comments**

Betty Staugler asked for public comments. No public comments were offered.

**15. Next Meeting's Topics and Date**

Date: Wednesday, October 14, 2009

Location: Fort Myers at the Southwest Florida Regional Planning Council.

**16. Adjourn**

Betty Staugler adjourned the meeting at 4:45 pm.